



Program Research and Recommendation

MINUTES

September 21, 2026

Members Present

Dr. Robert White, Co-Chairperson
Teresa Doyle, Dean
Colin Ferguson, Physical Sciences
Jessica Jackson, Articulation Officer
Ivana Valcarenghi, Student Representative

Kim Kirkwood, Academic Senate VP
Patrick McDougall, Patrick Curriculum Chair
Luke Sathrum, Computer Science
Bobby Walden, Counselor
Erik Madera, Student Representative

Members Absent

Irma Gonzalez Cuadros, Co-Chairperson
Erik Shearer, Asst Supt/VP Instruction

Brian Murphy, Director, Institutional Research

Guests Present

Kenneth Bearden, BUS Chair
Tom Williams, ITAG Associate Dean
Annie Rafferty, Dean of Workforce Development
Larry Abernathy, UAA
Alan Raetz, Institutional Research

Jeff Jordan, Health, KIN, and Athletics Chair
Robert Bishop, Dean of Athletics
Emiliano Jimenez-Cornejo, Training & Workforce Development

AGENDA

1. Agenda Adoption - 1 minute (3:02pm)

Motion to move item #6.C to Action Items 8D. M/S/P
Request for unanimous consent to approve agenda; M/S/P.

2. Minutes Approval - 1 minute (3:03pm)

A. May 11, 2026
Motion to approve minutes; M/S/P

3. General Announcements - 3 minutes

Program Research and Recommendation members are invited to make announcements to the committee

- None

4. Public Comments - 3 minutes

Members of the public are invited to comment on items not on the agenda

- None

5. Consent Agenda

- None

6. **Information Item(s) – 2 minutes (3:05pm)**

- Curriculum Committee Report

- The Curriculum Committee is currently reviewing Health & Public Services and finishing up the review of ITEC from last year. There isn't any current CCN to review.

Review of AP4021

- AP 4021 is currently under review to be updated from its last approved date of 3/28/2012. Bob would like the committee to consider reviewing the AP on a regular basis, perhaps annually. One option suggested would be to create separate bylaws that could be reviewed annually and avoid the longer AP review process. Input from the VP of Institutional Effectiveness will be sought regarding creating bylaws for the PRR committee. Edits or modifications suggested were Section 1.A, Program Research and Recommendation Committee, 1.B. Scope and Responsibilities, 1.C Regular Operations, and 1.D. Program Advisory Teams. Section 2.B Workflow 2: New Educational Program Approval., and Section 2.B Step 4 PRR Committee Review of PAT Findings. Section 2.C.1 Workflow 3 Program Vitality and Discontinuance Analysis, Section 2.C.3 Outcomes of Program Vitality Analysis and Discussion, 2.C.3.iii Recommendation to Discontinue. Full edit suggestions can be seen in the attachment.

7. **Pending Business Item(s)(3:10pm)**

A. Advanced Manufacturing

- Advance Manufacturing is currently with VP Erik Shearer for review.

8. **Action Item(s)**

A. Program Discontinuance

1. Associate Degree in Business Administration

Kenneth Bearden represented Business Administration

- The committee discussed the proposed deletion of the AS Business Administration degree. It was noted that the degree historically served as a transfer pathway to CSU, Chico; however, the introduction of Associate Degrees for Transfer (ADTs) has largely eliminated the need for the program.
- Discussion focused on the degree's limited current use, particularly among student-athletes, and concerns that the program title may be confusing to students. Currently only 10 – 12 student athletes will earn the AS in Business Administration per academic year.
- Members considered options for supporting affected students through waivers, substitutions, or CPL while emphasizing the importance of equitable access for all students. It was noted that using blanket waivers or substitutions can create inequitable curriculum and hidden waivers that students would not be aware of.
- The committee also discussed the potential development of a new general studies program with a business emphasis to provide greater flexibility for students pursuing business-related coursework and that local degrees have value to support students who are not transferring to a 4 year institution.
- Following discussion, a motion was approved to postpone consideration of the program deletion to allow the department time to explore and develop a potential replacement program.

Motion: To postpone consideration of the proposed program deletion to allow the department time to explore and develop a replacement program. (M/S/P) (4:24pm)

B. New Program Proposal

1. Certificate of Achievement in Personal Training

Jeff Jordan and Rob Bishop represented Kinesiology.

- The committee reviewed a proposed Certificate of Achievement in Personal Training intended to provide Kinesiology students with workforce-focused preparation for employment in fitness centers, schools, and related settings.
- Discussion highlighted alignment with existing Kinesiology programs, including the AA-T in Kinesiology, and noted growing demand for personal trainers both locally and nationally.
- Aligning the Certificate of Achievement with existing programs and adding two courses such as Sports Nutrition and Intro to Personal Training, aligns the certificate with what gyms are looking for in employees.
- Members discussed the growing field and career pathways for students, including preparation for nationally recognized personal training certification examinations. Information was also shared regarding professional development opportunities and industry partnerships through the California Community College Kinesiology, Health, Athletics, and Dance Association (CCCKD), including support for students pursuing certifications such as NASM and ACE.
- The committee recognized the program's potential to enhance employment opportunities and career readiness for students entering the fitness industry.

Motion: To move the Personal Training Program to Work Flow I. (M/S/P) (3:40pm)

C. New Program Research Utility Line Arborist

Tom Williams and Annie Rafferty represented

- The Training Place has been offering a not-for credit certificate in Arborist Training since 2019-2020 with great success. The curriculum was driven and established by industry needs.
- The committee reviewed a proposed Utility Line Arborist program that builds upon an established industry training model developed in partnership with PG&E and other workforce partners. Discussion emphasized strong labor market demand, both statewide and nationally, the program's alignment with industry-validated skills and assessments, and the opportunity for Butte College to become a leader in offering a credit and noncredit pathway in this emerging field. Members highlighted potential connections to related disciplines, including arboriculture, horticulture, environmental horticulture, and heavy equipment operation.
- Also mentioned was the opportunity for previous trainees to return to Butte College obtain Credit for Prior Learning, attend additional classes could then earn the AS degree, enhancing their opportunities for advancement in their career.
- The committee discussed the program's intensive hands-on training requirements, workforce preparation focus, and direct alignment with employment opportunities that offer competitive wages, benefits, and career advancement potential. The program's reputation within the utility industry, statewide training partnerships, and success in preparing students for industry assessments were noted as significant strengths. Discussion also included student pathways from certificates to degrees and advancement into supervisory and management roles.

- Operational considerations were reviewed, including required faculty-to-student ratios for safety, instructional hour requirements, unit consistency, facility and assessment resources located in Oroville, and the financial implications of offering the program within existing enrollment and funding constraints. Members also noted the availability of grant funding through 2028, anticipated future funding opportunities, and strong support from industry and community partners. The committee concluded with discussion regarding whether to move the proposal forward while acknowledging funding cap concerns and the need for a sustainable implementation plan.

Motion: To move the certificate and associate programs forward to the President's team.
(M/S/P) (4:34pm)

D. Formation of a small Program Review Workgroup with Academic Senate

Curriculum Chair, Senate Executive Member, and up to two volunteers from PRR/Senate

- The committee review the Program Review Dashboard. The tool incorporates key metrics, including demand, efficiency, FTES, fill rates, noncredit FTES, course and program success rates, learning outcomes, enrollment trends, curriculum status, and course review requirements at both the program and department levels.
- Each COI has tabs summarizing Program Success, Course Success, Demand Efficiency, Curriculum Scheduling and Learning Outcomes. Each tab can be opened for key metrics, including demand, efficiency, FTES, fill rates, noncredit FTES, course and program success rates, learning outcomes, enrollment trends, curriculum status, and course review requirements and both the program and department levels. Individual instructors can see the details for their own courses efficiency. Chairs can use this information to create the Chair level report to then move to the Dean, and then folded into an Institutional report.
- Discussion highlighted the use of large language models (LLMs) to generate draft summary narratives based on institutional data. These summaries are intended to serve as a starting point for departments, with customizable prompts available for departments, deans, chairs, and institutional-level users. Members noted that while individuals may access their own information, individual-level data remains confidential and is not visible to others.
- The tool is expected to be run annually and will provide a consistent reference point for program review, including information related to enrollment, student success, and program demand. Discussion also noted the alignment of the tool with evolving accreditation expectations and its role in supporting evidence-based decision-making. The proposed process will provide a structured and comprehensive review of program data to inform planning, resource allocation, and continuous improvement efforts.
- A work group consisting of the Curriculum Chair, Senate Executive Member, and two volunteers is needed to create a user's guide and guidelines for how to use the data provided. This document is will Patric McDougal as Curriculum Chair will serve and Luke Sathrum, Chair of Computer Sciences has volunteered.
- Work is to begin as soon as possible and be concluded within six weeks, with finalization completed in the spring 2027 semester.

Motion: To approve the formation of a small Program Review Workgroup (M/S/P) (4:36pm)

9. Discussion Item(s)

- Next Meeting Dates
 - October 19, 2026
 - November 16, 2026
 - December 14, 2026

10. **Adjournment**

Motion to adjourn; M/S/P

DRAFT