

PEER REVIEW TEAM REPORT

Butte College
3536 Butte Campus Dr.
Oroville, CA 95965

This report represents the findings of the Peer Review Team that conducted a virtual visit to Butte College from February 28 to March 3, 2022. The Commission acted on the accredited status of the institution during its June 2022 meeting and this team report must be reviewed in conjunction with the Commission's Action letter.

Dr. Kathleen A. Rose
Team Chair

Contents

Summary of Peer Review Process	6
Team Commendations	8
Team Recommendations	8
Recommendations to Meet Standards:	8
Recommendations to Improve Quality:	8
Introduction	9
Eligibility Requirements	10
Checklist for Evaluating Compliance with Federal Regulations and Related Commission Policies	11
Public Notification of a Peer Review Team Visit and Third-Party Comment	11
Standards and Performance with Respect to Student Achievement	12
Credits, Program Length, and Tuition	13
Transfer Policies	14
Distance Education and Correspondence Education	15
Student Complaints	16
Institutional Disclosure and Advertising and Recruitment Materials	17
Title IV Compliance	18
Standard I	19
I.A. Mission	19
I.B. Assuring Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness	20
I.C. Institutional Integrity	22
Standard II	24
II.A. Instructional Programs	24
II.B. Library and Learning Support Services	28
II.C. Student Support Services	29
Standard III	32
III.A. Human Resources	32
III.B. Physical Resources	35
III.C. Technology Resources	36
III.D. Financial Resources	38
Standard IV	41
IV.A. Decision-Making Roles and Processes	41
IV.B. Chief Executive Officer	43
IV.C. Governing Board	44
Quality Focus Essay	47

**Butte College
Comprehensive Peer Review Visit
Peer Review Team Roster**

Dr. Kathleen Rose, Team Chair

Superintendent/President
Gavilan College, Gilroy CA

Ms. Sydney LaRose, Team Assistant

Coordinator of Institutional Effectiveness and Planning
Gavilan College, Gilroy CA

ACADEMIC REPRESENTATIVES

Dr. Quinton Bemiller

Dean of Instruction
Norco College, Norco, CA

Dr. Emily Berg

K-16 Collaborative Coordinator
Reedley College, Reedley, CA

Dr. Eric Hanson

Dean, Library & Learning Support Services
Glendale Community College, Glendale, CA

Ms. Jeannie Kim-McPherson

Instructor, English and Faculty Coordinator, Guided Pathways
Monterey Peninsula College, Monterey, CA

Ms. Auli'i Silva

Grants Research & Prog Development Specialist, Professor
Leeward Community College, Pearl City, HI

ADMINISTRATIVE REPRESENTATIVES

Dr. Alex Adams

Senior Director of Institutional Research, Planning, and Effectiveness
Fresno City College, Fresno, CA

Dr. Oscar Cobian

Vice President of Student Development
Oxnard College, Oxnard CA

ADMINISTRATIVE REPRESENTATIVES

Dr. Christopher Dela Rosa

Vice President, Administrative and Technology Services
Ohlone College, Fremont, CA

Dr. Artemio "Art" Pimentel

President
Woodland Community College, Woodland, CA

ACCJC STAFF LIAISON

Dr. Gohar Momjian

Vice President
ACCJC

Summary of Peer Review Process

INSTITUTION: Butte College

DATES OF VISIT: February 28 to March 3, 2022

TEAM CHAIR: Dr. Kathleen Rose

An eleven-member accreditation team conducted a virtual visit to Butte College from February 28 to March 3, 2022, for the purpose of determining whether the College continues to meet Accreditation Standards, Eligibility Requirements, Commission Policies, and U.S. Department of Education regulations.

ACCJC's decision to conduct virtual visits for the Spring 2021 comprehensive reviews was based upon state mandated health guidelines, and the Commission's authority to implement flexibilities to accreditation processes and practices afforded by the federal government in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. Specifically, the U.S. Department of Education's March 17, 2020, guidance as well as all updates, permitted accreditors to perform virtual site visits for institutions if the accreditor follows up with an onsite visit in a reasonable amount of time to meet the statutory and regulatory requirements (though not necessarily a full peer-review site visit).

Consistent with on-site visits, and in accordance with the *Guide for Conducting Virtual Visits: An Addendum for Peer Review Team Chairs, Team Members, and Colleges*, which ACCJC provided to team chairs, peer reviewers, and colleges being reviewed, the virtual peer review team visit to Butte College relied on an engaged and interactive format. The team conducted multiple interviews with college representatives, participated in team meetings to discuss findings, and conducted the required campus forums. The team evaluated how well the College is achieving its stated purposes, providing recommendations for quality assurance and institutional improvement.

In preparation for the visit, the team chair attended via Zoom a team chair training workshop on December 1, 2021 and held a pre-visit meeting with the college CEO on January 5, 2022. During this virtual pre-visit, the team chair met with campus leadership and key personnel involved in the self-evaluation preparation process. The entire peer review team received team training provided by staff from ACCJC via Zoom on February 1, 2022.

The peer review team received the college's self-evaluation document (ISER) and related evidence January 3, 2022, several weeks prior to the team's virtual college visit. Team members found the ISER to be a comprehensive, well-written document detailing the processes used by the College to address Eligibility Requirements, Commission Standards, and Commission Policies. The team confirmed that the ISER was developed through broad participation by the entire College community including faculty, staff, students, and administration. The team found that the College provided a thoughtful ISER containing several self-identified action plans for institutional improvement. The College also prepared a Quality Focus Essay.

Prior to the virtual visit, team members completed their team assignments, identified areas for further investigation, and provided a list of interview requests. During the visit, team members spent each afternoon of the visiting week discussing their initial observations and their preliminary review of the written materials and evidence provided by the College. The college kicked off the virtual visit by first holding a team meeting, then participating in a welcoming virtual reception with the Butte College community. This included a virtual tour and introductions of key members of the faculty, classified staff, and administration. Although the visit was virtual, the College provided all logistics as needed to fully engage with the campus community.

During the visit, team members met with approximately 102 faculty, administrators, classified staff and students in formal meetings, group interviews and individual interviews. Team members met with three trustees from the College. The team held two open forums, which were well attended, and provided the College community and others an opportunity to share their thoughts with members of the evaluation team. The team thanks the entire Butte College staff for coordinating and hosting the virtual visit meetings and interviews, and ensuring a smooth process, which held high standards for the integrity of the peer review process.

Major Findings and Recommendations of the Peer Review Team Report

Team Commendations

Commendation 1: The team commends the College for ensuring continuous, equitable student access to instruction and support services regardless of location and mode of delivery through five traumatic events, exemplifying the College's "Students First" philosophy while ensuring fiscal stability during times of crises and uncertainty in funding. (II.A.7; II.C.3; III.D.9)

Team Recommendations

Recommendations to Meet Standards:

Recommendation 1: In order to meet the Standard, the team recommends the College assure the effectiveness of all employees by evaluating them systematically and at stated intervals. (III.A.5)

Recommendations to Improve Quality:

Recommendation 2: In order to strengthen the currency, integrity, and effectiveness of policies, the team recommends the College and Board review its process to ensure timely review and implementation of all Board Policies and Administrative Procedures. (IV.C.7)

Introduction

Butte College is a mid-sized rural college in a single college district located on 928 acres near the geographic center of Butte County. The Butte Community College District was originally formed to serve Butte County on November 8, 1966. In 1976, the District expanded to serve major portions of Glenn County and on April 26, 1995, it became the Butte-Glenn Community College District.

Since its founding in the late 1960s, Butte College has grown from several trailers at Durham High School into a comprehensive campus that serves nearly 15,000 students each year (pre pandemic). The College currently consists of the Main Campus, the Chico Center, the Glenn County Center, and the Skyway Center; classes are also offered at several outlying locations. Most of the Main Campus acreage remains undeveloped, and the Board of Trustees has designated the area a wildlife refuge. Because of its rural location, Butte College is unique among California Community Colleges in that it operates as a self-contained city. The College is self-sufficient, depending on its own solar power, well water and sewage processing plant.

For the team to fully understand the many challenges Butte has faced since the last comprehensive accreditation visit, it is important to acknowledge that the college has been operating in a traumatic environment for the past five years. The Oroville Spillway Incident was the first in February 2017. A compromise was found in the dam, resulting in nearly 200,000 people who lived in the floodplain being ordered to evacuate immediately. This evacuation affected both Butte College employees and students, disrupting instruction and college work for several days. It was during this time that the college began to refine its emergency response protocols to ensure safety and to maintain operations in a time of crisis. This was done just in time to activate again for the Camp Fire Incident, the Public Safety Power Shut Offs, the COVID-19 pandemic, and the North Complex (Bear) Fire.

During each crisis, the College served the community in multiple ways, including as a staging area, providing food and basic services for Butte students and community members. The President also formed a Crisis Response Team to anticipate future recovery needs and ensure that instruction continued during each incident.

Each incident also impacted many aspects of Butte's enrollment decline, starting in 2015 with shifting demographics and an improved economy. As a result of these factors and the five crises experienced by the College, enrollments have declined 22% by 2020. Several interventions have been planned, and there is a focus on integrated planning and new growth. There has been consistent leadership during the review period, and it was obvious to the team that the Butte faculty and staff are dedicated to the success of their students.

Based on the Butte College Institutional Self Evaluation Report (ISER), the Quality Focus Essay, individual and group interviews, as well as the open forums, it is clear that Butte College has identified goals and plans for continuous improvement as per the ACCJC standards.

Eligibility Requirements

1. Authority

The team confirmed that Butte College is authorized to operate as a post-secondary, degree-granting institution based on continuous accreditation from the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC) of the Western Association of Schools and Colleges (WASC). Butte College is authorized by the State of California, the Board of Governors of the California Community College System, and the Board of Trustees of Butte College.

The College meets the Eligibility Requirement.

2. Operational Status

The Team confirmed that Butte College is operational, serving approximately 15,000 students in credit and noncredit courses during the 2020-21 academic year. As evidenced by their Annual Report posted on their website, the majority of students are actively pursuing certificate programs, degree programs, and/or transfer.

The College meets the Eligibility Requirement.

3. Degrees

Butte College offers 205 programs in five Communities of Interest, including 31 Associate Degrees for Transfer, 69 Associate Degrees, 52 Certificates of Achievement, and 53 Certificates of Completion. The team confirmed that all associate degrees require a minimum of 60 units. Most of the courses offered by the college lead to a degree, certificate or transfer and most students are enrolled in courses leading to transfer and/or a degree or certificate.

The College meets the Eligibility Requirement.

4. Chief Executive Officer

The Team confirmed the College has a Superintendent/President who is the Chief Executive Officer of the District. The Superintendent/President is appointed by the Board of Trustees and serves as the administrator who has been delegated authority to administer Board Policies, Administrative Procedures, and provides leadership for the overall operations of the College in planning, budgeting, personnel, and institutional effectiveness.

The College meets the Eligibility Requirement.

5. Financial Accountability

The team confirmed that Butte College engages a qualified independent auditor to conduct audits of all financial records. All audits are certified, and all explanations of findings are documented appropriately and addressed by the College. The audit is presented annually to the Board and is available to the public.

The College meets the Eligibility Requirement.

Checklist for Evaluating Compliance with Federal Regulations and Related Commission Policies

The evaluation items detailed in this Checklist are those which fall specifically under federal regulations and related Commission policies, beyond what is articulated in the Accreditation Standards; other evaluation items under ACCJC standards may address the same or similar subject matter. The peer review team evaluated the institution's compliance with Standards as well as the specific Checklist elements from federal regulations and related Commission policies noted here.

Public Notification of a Peer Review Team Visit and Third-Party Comment

Evaluation Items:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has made an appropriate and timely effort to solicit third party comment in advance of a comprehensive review visit.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution cooperates with the review team in any necessary follow-up related to the third party comment.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Rights, Responsibilities, and Good Practice in Relations with Member Institutions</i> as to third party comment.

[Regulation citation: 602.23(b).]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

The College posted a link to the third-party comment form maintained by ACCJC on its accreditation webpage. The College presented the Institutional Self Evaluation Report (ISER) to the Board of Trustees in a public meeting and on the campus website. ACCJC did not receive third-party comments in advance of the site visit. The College demonstrates compliance with the Commission Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of the Commission and Member Institutions as to third party comment.

Standards and Performance with Respect to Student Achievement

Evaluation Items:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance across the institution and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. Course completion is included as one of these elements of student achievement. Other elements of student achievement performance for measurement have been determined as appropriate to the institution's mission. (Standard I.B.3 and Section B. Presentation of Student Achievement Data and Institution-set Standards)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance within each instructional program and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. The defined elements include, but are not limited to, job placement rates for program completers, and for programs in fields where licensure is required, the licensure examination passage rates for program completers. (Standard I.B.3 and Section B. Presentation of Student Achievement Data and Institution-set Standards)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution-set standards for programs and across the institution are relevant to guide self-evaluation and institutional improvement; the defined elements and expected performance levels are appropriate within higher education; the results are reported regularly across the campus; and the definition of elements and results are used in program-level and institution-wide planning to evaluate how well the institution fulfills its mission, to determine needed changes, to allocating resources, and to make improvements. (Standard I.B.3, Standard I.B.9)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution analyzes its performance as to the institution-set standards and as to student achievement and takes appropriate measures in areas where its performance is not at the expected level. (Standard I.B.4)

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(i); 602.17(f); 602.19 (a-e).]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

The College has defined institution-set standards and stretch goals that are relevant to the institution for course completion, degree and certificate completion, and transfer. Job placement rates and licensure exam pass rates are established for relevant CTE programs. These standards are evaluated annually by the Educational Master Planning Committee and documented in the Vision for Success Balanced Scorecard. The goals in the College's Educational Master Plan (EMP) are aligned with the

College’s institution-set standards. All programs work toward accomplishment of the EMP goals through the Multi-Year Integrated Planning System (MIPS) and the annual Strategic Directions. Course success rate, completion, and transfer data are analyzed through these processes to inform improvements and identify resources needed to support student achievement and learning.

Credits, Program Length, and Tuition

Evaluation Items:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Credit hour assignments and degree program lengths are within the range of good practice in higher education (in policy and procedure). (Standard II.A.9)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The assignment of credit hours and degree program lengths is verified by the institution, and is reliable and accurate across classroom based courses, laboratory classes, distance education classes, and for courses that involve clinical practice (if applicable to the institution). (Standard II.A.9)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Tuition is consistent across degree programs (or there is a rational basis for any program-specific tuition). (Standard I.C.2)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Any clock hour conversions to credit hours adhere to the Department of Education’s conversion formula, both in policy and procedure, and in practice. (Standard II.A.9)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits</i> .

[Regulation citations: 600.2 (definition of credit hour); 602.16(a)(1)(viii); 602.24(e), (f); 668.2; 668.9.]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission’s requirements.

Narrative:

The team reviewed the College Catalog, website and policy and determined that the College applies good practice in higher education when assigning credit hours and determining program lengths. This is applicable to classroom, lab, distance education classes and courses that involve clinical practice. Tuition is consistent across degree programs and clock hour conversions to credit hours align to the Department of Education’s conversion formula. Finally, College practices align with the Commission Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits.

Transfer Policies

Evaluation Items:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Transfer policies are appropriately disclosed to students and to the public. (Standard II.A.10)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Policies contain information about the criteria the institution uses to accept credits for transfer. (Standard II.A.10)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution complies with the Commission <i>Policy on Transfer of Credit</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(viii); 602.17(a)(3); 602.24(e); 668.43(a)(ii).]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

Transfer-of-credit policies are made available to students via multiple sources, including the College website, the Catalog, the Schedule, and in individual student appointments with transfer counselors and advisors. The information contained in the policies explains transfer requirements to four-year public and private colleges and universities. The transfer tool used to offer customized transfer of credit information or information on articulation agreements to students is accurate and current. The transfer policies comply with the Commission's policy on transfer of credit.

Distance Education and Correspondence Education

Evaluation Items:

For Distance Education:	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates regular and substantive interaction between students and the instructor.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates comparable learning support services and student support services for distance education students. (Standards II.B.1, II.C.1)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution verifies that the student who registers in a distance education program is the same person who participates every time and completes the course or program and receives the academic credit.
For Correspondence Education:	
<input type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates comparable learning support services and student support services for correspondence education students. (Standards II.B.1, II.C.1)
<input type="checkbox"/>	The institution verifies that the student who registers in a correspondence education program is the same person who participates every time and completes the course or program and receives the academic credit.
Overall:	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The technology infrastructure is sufficient to maintain and sustain the distance education and correspondence education offerings. (Standard III.C.1)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(iv), (vi); 602.17(g); 668.38.]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the Institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The college does not offer Distance Education or Correspondence Education.

Narrative:

The College does not offer Correspondence Education courses. The team reviewed a sample of regularly scheduled online courses, as well as a sample of classes scheduled for remote instruction and found that the institution meets the Commission's requirements. The team found evidence of regular and substantive interaction between students and instructor, as well as evidence that

comparable learning support and student support services are available for distance education students. Overall, the team found that the institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education.

Student Complaints

Evaluation Items:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has clear policies and procedures for handling student complaints, and the current policies and procedures are accessible to students in the college catalog and online.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The student complaint files for the previous seven years (since the last comprehensive review) are available; the files demonstrate accurate implementation of the complaint policies and procedures.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team analysis of the student complaint files identifies any issues that may be indicative of the institution's noncompliance with any Accreditation Standards.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution posts on its website the names of associations, agencies and governmental bodies that accredit, approve, or license the institution and any of its programs, and provides contact information for filing complaints with such entities. (Standard I.C.1)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Representation of Accredited Status</i> and the <i>Policy on Student and Public Complaints Against Institutions</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(ix); 668.43.]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

The team reviewed a sample of student complaints and found that they are handled in a timely manner and contain issues that are typical of institutions of higher education and not out of compliance with accreditation standards. Policies and procedures are accessible in the catalog and online and information regarding all accrediting organizations are listed on the website. College practices align with the Policy on Representation of Accredited Status and the Policy on Student and Public Complaints Against Institutions.

Institutional Disclosure and Advertising and Recruitment Materials

Evaluation Items:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution provides accurate, timely (current), and appropriately detailed information to students and the public about its programs, locations, and policies. (Standard I.C.2)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution complies with the Commission <i>Policy on Institutional Advertising, Student Recruitment, and Policy on Representation of Accredited Status</i> .
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution provides required information concerning its accredited status. (Standard I.C.12)

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(vii); 668.6.]

Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

The team reviewed all elements of this component and found that the institution meets the Commission's policy requirements. The institution provides accurate and timely information to students and the public about its programs, locations, policies, and accreditation status.

Title IV Compliance

Evaluation Items:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has presented evidence on the required components of the Title IV Program, including findings from any audits and program or other review activities by the U.S. Department of Education (ED). (Standard III.D.15)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	If applicable, the institution has addressed any issues raised by ED as to financial responsibility requirements, program record-keeping, etc. If issues were not timely addressed, the institution demonstrates it has the fiscal and administrative capacity to timely address issues in the future and to retain compliance with Title IV program requirements. (Standard III.D.15)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	If applicable, the institution's student loan default rates are within the acceptable range defined by ED. Remedial efforts have been undertaken when default rates near or meet a level outside the acceptable range. (Standard III.D.15)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	If applicable, contractual relationships of the institution to offer or receive educational, library, and support services meet the Accreditation Standards and have been approved by the Commission through substantive change if required. (Standard III.D.16)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the <i>Commission Policy on Contractual Relationships with Non-Accredited Organizations</i> and the <i>Policy on Institutional Compliance with Title IV</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(v); 602.16(a)(1)(x); 602.19(b); 668.5; 668.15; 668.16; 668.71 et seq.]

Conclusion Check-Off:

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

Narrative:

The College demonstrates compliance with Federal Title IV regulations and US ED requirements. The College has no Department of Education findings, and the student loan default rate is within the acceptable range. The Team examined the report of the independent auditor and confirmed that there are no audit findings related to compliance with Title IV regulations.

Standard I

Mission, Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness

Standard I

Mission, Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness

I.A. Mission

General Observations:

Butte College has a broad mission statement that incorporates its commitment to the students it serves and the expansive commitment to services and programs for the communities it serves. The College has established planning and resource allocation processes for its multiple plans and strategic goal setting institutional planning through an Educational Master Plan (EMP), Facilities Master Plan, Program Reviews and Strategic initiatives. The college is very aware that it is a growing Hispanic Serving Institution (HSI) and the Team observed multiple conversations about the importance of the designation to better serve Latino/a students.

Findings and Evidence:

Butte College's mission was most recently approved by the college and board of trustees in the spring of 2018. The mission is clear to its purpose of being a "student centered institution" that is focused on "preparing students to be productive members of a diverse society". The college confirms its commitment to equity through a set of "College Values" and confirms a growing Latino/a population and its commitment to serving the diverse population of students. The College reaffirms its commitment to serving as an open access institution. (I.A.1)

It is clear the College uses a variety of metrics to assess its accomplishment of its mission through a variety of qualitative and quantitative methods. As an example, the college cites facilitating focus groups of students as a method to collect data as evidence of its assessment of the mission including survey tools. The college also uses its annual reports to the State Chancellor's office like Student Equity, Vision for Success. (I.A.2)

Butte College has a wide variety of programs that it offers in a very rural district. The college has aligned many of its programs with Chico State University which is near the college center.. The college demonstrates its commitment to evaluate its programs for informed decision making and its mission along with its Educational Master Plan (EMP). The college has an Institutional Effectiveness Manual that aligns its Mission and integrated planning systems. (I.A.3)

Butte College periodically reviews and publishes its mission statement in many prominent locations and promotes its objectives on its website and by a variety of communications including in its own EMP. (I.A.4)

Conclusion: The College meets the standard.

I.B. Assuring Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness

General Observations:

Butte College has established robust tools to assess the quality of its academic and student services programs. The College has also established processes through regular evaluation of its Institutional Effectiveness Manual. The College has a structured shared governance model to discuss and assess its Student Learning Outcomes and its units to make sure that the College is meeting its Mission. The College is also focused on meeting the Vision for Success Goals to serve as an equitable institution. Student learning and achievement data are analyzed through Butte's integrated planning processes and systematic evaluation of data by programs and services resulted in improvements, implementation of changes, and evaluation of changes for improvement in institutional effectiveness and academic quality.

Findings and Evidence:

Butte College has established "robust" assessment tools for assessing its programs and has separated Student Learning Outcomes in a variety of thematic areas that includes Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs), General Education Learning (GEL) Outcomes, and Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs). They are assessed annually, and the college engages a variety of constituencies through forms that are linked to the institutional effectiveness office. The College engages in systematic and inclusive program reviews every six-years using student achievement data and the process has multiple opportunities for curriculum and program needs to be met and reviewed by a validation team. The college also assesses its equity plan on an annual basis and uses a variety of tools like planning dashboards to evaluate programs. (I.B.1)

The College has developed an assessment cycle for all instructional and student programs. These programs are "regularly" assessed through discussions at the department level and through the curriculum development process. Student learning outcomes (SLOs) are established for courses, programs, and learning and student support services. These are confirmed in the college's catalog, website and via forms collected by the college. The Team was shown examples of completed reports that confirmed the college's evaluation process. (I.B.2)

Butte College establishes institution-set standards for student achievement with their Vision for Success Balance Scorecard. The EMP Committee reviews the data and ensures that the College's standards are appropriate and directly tied to its Mission. The College has defined institution-set standards and stretch goals that are relevant to the institution for course completion, degree and certificate completion, and transfer. Job placement rates and licensure exam pass rates are established for relevant CTE programs. The goals in the College's Educational Master Plan (EMP) are aligned with the College's institution-set standards. All programs work toward accomplishment of the EMP goals through the Multi-Year Integrated Planning System (MIPS) and the annual Strategic Directions. Course success rate, completion, and transfer data are analyzed through these processes to inform improvements and identify resources needed to support student achievement and learning. The College ensures that the data is published on the website and widely communicated to all College constituencies. (I.B.3)

The College has established an annual process to assess data to support student learning and student achievement. The College Council and EMP Committee review programs on a regular basis. In addition, the Student Equity and Achievement Program Advisory Committee (SEAPAC) collects data and reviews the student success and transfer data annually. (I.B.4)

The College evaluates its Mission through a variety of methods that includes program reviews, student learning outcomes, and student achievement reviews by utilizing qualitative and quantitative data. The College uses a variety of instruments to collect data to meet the standard including the Entering Engagement Survey (SENSE), Community College Survey of Student Engagement (CCSSEE), and CTE Employment Outcomes Survey (CTEOS). All of these reviews and information are accessible through department program reviews and Unit Planning dashboards and are updated annually (I.B.5)

Butte College disaggregates student achievement data by student subpopulations to identify performance gaps and student achievement. The data is collected and reviewed by a variety of committees including the Student Equity and Achievement Program and Advisory Committee (SEAPAC). Disaggregated results are also shared through FLEX Activities led by the Student Learning Outcomes Committee and the student success data is used by department and units to make resource requests (I.B.6)

The College evaluates its policies and practices by developing a multiyear integrated planning system and Planning, Budgeting, and Assessment (PBA) process to align systems and achieve student learning goals. The processes for evaluation of its practices are conducted every year and all constituencies are included in that process through a variety of committees. The college shows its commitment to shared governance by outlining its decision-making process in the Institutional Effectiveness Manual which was updated in Spring 2019. Based on interviews during the visit, the Team encourages the College to formalize College Council's role in evaluating the program review processes and governance structure. (I.B.7)

The College broadly communicates the results of its assessment and evaluation activities to all constituencies on the strengths and weaknesses through a variety of committees that include the Planning and Budget Committee, Leadership Team, SLO Committee, and the Board of Trustees. The College posts results on its website from surveys. The College cites a Strategic Planning Retreat held in 2018 which provided updates to the college community on a regular basis from meetings, workshops, email communication and its website. The college had several disruptive events that included natural disasters in 2017 where these communications were done less frequently. The Team determined that the college has an integrated planning process that evaluates its programs for changes and improvements to serve students. (I.B.8)

Butte College engages in continuous, broad-based, systemic evaluation and planning. The College cites an extensive evaluation and allocation mode through a variety of processes including the Multi-Year Integrated Planning System (MIPS) and the Planning, Budgeting, and Assessment (PBA) process. The College cites its EMP as an umbrella document that identifies its short and long-term goals and the process to assess those goals. Program reviews are the primary vehicle for the college to reflect and discusses its evaluation of academic quality. (I.B.9)

Conclusion: The College meets the standard.

I.C. Institutional Integrity

General Observations:

Butte College demonstrates institutional integrity through its commitment to the clarity, accuracy, and integrity of publications and information provided to college constituents and the community. The College publishes its mission statement and values, EMP, accredited status, student learning outcomes, instructional programs, courses, student support services, and student fees in the College Catalog and on the website. Student achievement and learning data are made available to the public to communicate matters of academic quality. Board Policy and Administrative Procedures outline expectations for academic freedom, honesty, and professional ethics for all constituent groups, including the student code of conduct and grievance process.

Findings and Evidence:

The College ensures clarity and accuracy of the information provided to the college community related to its Mission by having it disseminated around campus, via its website, college catalog, and by the CEO. The College prepares and prints an annual report that is distributed to the community and provides information about its student success data and programs. The college also prints and distributes information about educational programs, program SLOs, general education outcomes, course content, and student support services via a variety of formats including having a virtual Welcome Center called the Roadrunner Rush. Course SLOs are listed on every course syllabus of record and SLOs are included as part of the grade submission process by faculty. The Team confirmed the college's practices of disseminating information and evaluating its academic and student services programs through an integrated planning and evaluation model. (I.C.1)

Butte College provides a catalog that is accessible and available to students and prospective students. The catalog is available via print and on the college's website. The college has a detailed and consistent annual catalog production cycle. (I.C.2)

The College has documented assessment of student learning and student achievement and communicated those to all the constituencies. The college's SLO process outlines the process in which faculty communicate them to the student body. The College also makes institutional reports and student achievement data dashboards available on their website and incorporates the data in the form of the Vision for Success Balanced Scorecard, EMP, and the Planning and Budgeting and Assessment website (I.C.3)

Butte College describes their degrees and certificates in terms of their purpose, content, course requirements, and program SLOs through brochures and its webpage. All degrees and certificates include units and when applicable, pre-requisites or admissions requirements and are downloadable from the college's website (I.C.4)

The College reviews its institutional policies, procedures and publications to assure integrity of its mission, programs, and services via a set of standards that include the Multi-Year Integrated Planning System (MIPS) and other annual processes. The College has developed an outline that is published about how MIPS ties into the College's mission and values. The "Institutional

Bedrock includes the Colleges' mission values and vision and are assessed annually. The College also cites the Planning, Budgeting, and Assessment web page which shows the process of each detailed plan to assure compliance with its own practices. The Team observed a presentation of the college's MIPS process and the dashboard it uses to extract data and evaluate its programs. (I.C.5)

Butte College publishes the total cost of education to current and prospective students via the College Catalog and the Financial Aid webpage. The College cites other means to communicate the opportunity for students to identify the courses that have low cost or zero cost textbooks with a designated symbol for students. (I.C.6)

As evidenced in the ISER, Butte College's Board Policy (BP) and Administrative Procedure (AP) 4030 articulates academic freedom. The policy is available on the college's website and is posted on its College Catalog. The College also has Board Policy (BP) 3900 that addresses "hate speech" that addresses issues of harassment not appropriate to be identified as academic freedom. The BP 4300 was last updated in 2011 and BP 3900 was last updated in 2019. (I.C.7)

Butte College has Board Policy (BP) 5500 which includes a broad statement of academic honesty with a more detailed description in Administrative Procedure 5500. The policy describes standards of student conduct, including expectations for academic honesty, code of conduct, and student grievance procedures. The College publishes the standards in its College Catalog and students also receive the information on all class syllabi. (I.C.8)

Butte College adopted a statement on Professional Ethics of Faculty describing that faculty are required to adhere to a detailed code of professional ethics. Faculty are evaluated on their performance, preparation of instruction, approachability, and reliability. Faculty are held accountable and are responsible to adhere to these standards. (I.C.9)

Butte College is a public two-year California Community College and communicates its codes of conduct and expectations to students, faculty, and administrators in the College Catalog and on its website. The Butte College Code of Ethics and Ethical Standards provides the requirements for the entire college community. (I.C.10)

A portion of this standard is not applicable to Butte College as it does not operate in any foreign locations. (I.C.11)

Butte College demonstrates a commitment to compliance with the Commission's eligibility requirements, accreditation standards, and policies through the development of the Accreditation Support Team (AST). The College holds Flex workshops to communicate and update the college community about the accreditation process. The College also posts all communications received by the commission and the community has access to past accreditation ISERs dating back to 2008. The College also complies with federal guidelines for international admissions, as evidenced by the international admissions processes posted on their website. (I.C.12)

The College practices honesty in all its communication to the college and community about its accreditation process and status. The College has a diverse Accreditation Support Team that

collaborates across the college community to ensure that all voices are heard and participate in the process. (I.C.13)

The College is a public institution and demonstrates its commitment to high quality education, student achievement, and student learning through their mission and values, EMP goals, and student equity plan. Board Policy (BP) 6300 Fiscal Management and Administrative Policy (AP) show its commitment to its fiscal sustainability. The College displays its budget criteria and fiscal focus on educational commitment to provide students with high quality and accessible education. (I.C.14)

Conclusion: The College meets the standard.

Standard II

Student Learning Programs and Support Services

II.A. Instructional Programs

General Observations:

Butte College offers 205 programs organized in five Communities of Interest: Business Arts and Design; Public Health and Human Services; Social and Behavioral Studies and Communications; Industrial Technologies and Agriculture; and Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math.

Butte College provides this wide breadth of programs with aligned learning outcomes at the course, program and institutional level. Within the five Communities of Interest, Butte College offers 31 Associate Degrees for Transfer, 69 Associate Degrees, 52 Certificates of Achievement, and 53 Certificates of Completion. The General Education curriculum is set by faculty, and required of all students in Associate degree programs. CTE students are informed of job opportunities, employment data, job projections and licensure rates, and many CTE students obtain external licensure and certification. All programs undergo a systematic Program Review process every six years, every two years for CTE programs, and every seven years for Student Services.

Findings and Evidence:

A variety of degree and certificate programs are offered by the college, including transfer and career pathways for students, in addition to non-credit and not-for-credit offerings taught in several different modalities, including face-to-face, hybrid, and online; the program review process encourages programs to examine data on student achievement in degrees and certificates. Numerous courses are offered at the Main Campus and the College's four centers: Cosmetology and Barbering; Glenn County Center; Skyway Center; and Chico Center. All of the programs offered support the College's mission to provide instruction to students to become "life-long learners and critical thinkers." (II.A.1)

Curriculum is a core responsibility of the college's faculty and departments, in terms of development for courses and programs, with the Academic Senate's Curriculum Committee review to ensure generally accepted academic and professional standards of higher education, with the Board of Trustees granting final approval. The college has recently restructured Curriculum review periods based on the Communities of Interest; which will now restructure the Program Review process and its cycle to complement these recent changes. Using a cyclical, multi-year program review along with annual program and unit updates, the college assesses and tracks learning outcomes to aid in integrated college planning with the college's MIPS (Multi-year Integrated Planning System). Distance education has a separate review process with four components that are required, and robust professional development supports currency in teaching methodologies for all faculty. (II.A.2)

The college has an established cycle of assessment for learning outcomes at the course, program, and degree levels using established institutional procedures at multiple components, including the reflection by faculty when submitting final course grades. Student learning outcomes for every course are reviewed and approved by the Curriculum Committee and published on the college's website and are required to be included on all syllabi. (II.A.3)

The college has established a clear process and criteria for data-driven decision-making from the Curriculum committee to offer pre-collegiate to collegiate level curriculum, and offers numerous noncredit courses, including programs in Occupational and Life Skills and English as a Second Language. The noncredit courses, designed to meet the community's needs, are targeted to students such as those who have disabilities; are older adults, second language learners, or incarcerated; or have skill level below transfer in subjects such as business or math. These courses provide a bridge for these students to meet their individual goals, including career and transfer pathways. Course number sequencing outlined in the college catalog and college website clearly distinguishes for students whether the course is degree credit, non-degree credit, or noncredit. (II.A.4)

Practices common to higher education—for length, breadth, depth, rigor, course sequencing, time to completion, and synthesis of learning—are adhered to by the college's degrees and programs, overseen by the Curriculum Committee, a committee under jurisdiction of the Academic Senate and with administrative oversight by the Vice President of Instruction. The college's Local GE Guide and catalog states all associate degrees must be at least 60 units. Yearly training references overviews of PCAH, Program and Course Approval Handbook to update attendees and serve as a guide for the Curriculum Committee's work. (II.A.5)

The college prioritizes the creation of a "student-centered schedule," to allow students to complete programs in a timely manner consistent with established expectations in higher education. Program Review Self-Study process asks programs to reflect on both the demand for their course offerings and their scheduling of courses. Block scheduling gives students consistency, and deans and department chairs closely monitor data via waitlists and fill rates on the schedules to make informed choices to optimize student choice. Clear program maps are provided to aid student selection of courses on college website. (II.A.6)

To serve the diverse needs of its student population, the college offers courses at a variety of locations across its main campus and centers, times, and modalities of instruction, including face-to-face, hybrid, and online instruction. The team heard feedback from students and distance education instructors that crisis response has led to improvement to distance education courses and professional development to support efforts such as the use of Open Educational Resources and universal design. Distance education courses, whether hybrid or fully online, require review and approval by departments and the Curriculum Committee, and instructors desiring to teach these courses must meet requirements for training on effective and accessible distance education course design and teaching methods. These examples, as well as evidence reviewed, confirmed for the visiting team that the College was consistent in providing targeted services throughout multiple emergency events.

Support services are provided to all students through the Center for Academic Success, which maintains services in person at the main campus every day during the week with some evening hours and two centers in addition to online services for all students. NetTutor through Canvas provides online support for all students at all hours. Additional services, both in-person and online, are available through the library and through programs such as DSPS and EOPS. (II.A.7)

The college has a structure in place to determine pre-requisite criteria and ensure application with consistency. Through the Curriculum Committee, programs can submit Prerequisite and Corequisite Proposals. Students also have options to submit transcripts for evaluation to meet prerequisites and to challenge prerequisites. The College no longer offers placement assessments, relying on prerequisites for certain college programs such as nursing. Students can elect to use self-assessment tools in English and Math placement through the Career and Academic Assessment Center. Several professional development opportunities are provided for faculty to help reduce bias when assessing students, and departments evaluate assessment tests, such as English. A process is being developed for evaluating and awarding credit for students' prior learning as reflected in AP 4235. (II.A.8)

Butte College awards credit, degrees and certificates based on student attainment of learning outcomes at the Course, Program, General Education, and Institutional levels. Institutional policies for awarding credit include Butte College's Board Policy 4220 (Standards of Scholarship), Administrative Procedure 4080 (Standards for Credit Hour Calculations), Administrative Procedure 4020 (Program and Curriculum Development) and Administrative Procedure 4230 (Grading and Academic Record Symbols). Butte College has no clock hour programs. (II.A.9)

The College has clear policies on transfer-of credit, which are communicated to students through the College Catalog, the Admissions & Records website and automated email. Official and unofficial transcripts contain completed transcript evaluations and are available to students through the Self-Service portal and Starfish degree planner, once it is fully implemented. The College's course numbering system indicates transferability status for each course, and the College is also part of the Course Identification Numbering System (C-ID), which identifies course articulation between the California Community Colleges, the California State Universities, and the University of California systems. The College's Articulation Officer regularly reviews transfer of coursework and policies. (II.A.10)

Butte College has adopted six programmatic learning outcomes which are aligned with four Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs). To facilitate regular assessment of learning outcomes, course-level SLOs are mapped to the ILOs in the Curriculum System, with department discussions informing unit planning and program improvement. ILOs are assessed in a collaborative campus-wide process. Program learning outcomes (PLOs) are mapped to SLOs and are updated in the Program Review process and tracked over time through departmental learning outcomes work each semester. (II.A.11)

Butte College's SLO Committee and Academic Senate designed the General Education Philosophy and Learning Outcomes, which is detailed in the College Catalog and upheld by Board Policy 4025: Philosophy and Criteria for Associate Degree and General Education. The Academic Senate also approves the review and revision of a General Education Learning Outcomes (GELOs) every six years. The Curriculum Committee approves GE courses based on faculty rationale and the alignment of at least one course SLO to a GELO. The General Education Philosophy requires AA/AS degrees to include 20 units of general education (GE) classes in six specific discipline areas. (II.A.12)

Butte College offers 31 Associate Degrees for Transfer, 69 Associate Degrees, 52 Certificates of Achievement, and 53 Certificates of Completion. Every degree program includes focused study in at least one area of inquiry or in an established interdisciplinary core. A multi-level review process is employed for the creation of degree programs, including Curriculum Committee's approval of program level outcomes and course level outcomes. (II.A.13)

Butte College utilizes brochures and websites to inform students of job opportunities in specific career-technical disciplines, and other information such as employment data, job projections and licensure rates, which are retrieved from licensing agencies. At least twice yearly, local and regional business and industry experts serve on advisory committees that help review curriculum in CTE programs at the College. Every two years, industry partners and faculty engage in a Program Review process to improve and maintain CTE programs. External licensure and certification is required by outside accrediting or regulatory agencies for many occupational programs. Programs, departments and individual faculty conduct regular assessments of approved SLO's and PLO's in CTE programs. (II.A.14)

Butte College's procedure for program elimination is spelled out in AP 4021 Program and Research Recommendation (2012/2014). BP 4021 (2010) sets the context for discontinuance and instructs the Vice President of Student Learning and Academic Senate to collaborate in meeting the requirements of Title V Section 51022. Catalog rights and opportunity for course substitution are potential ways to avoid disruption to students. AP 4021 does not require a detailed plan and timeline for program discontinuance; rather, it states that when the Program Research and Recommendation Committee (PRR) recommends discontinuance of a program, it "may consider and/or include" various items, including "a detailed plan and recommended timeline for phasing out the program for discontinuance with the least impact on students, faculty, staff and the community." Program changes have been communicated to students on the department webpage, however, there are no examples of program discontinuance. (II.A.15)

In an effort to support continual improvement, Butte College has a systematic Program Review process in place, which all programs undergo every six years, and every two years for CTE

programs. The Program Review process includes multiple aspects, including analysis of SLO assessments, completion goals, disaggregated data, demonstration of support of the College's mission and response to previous recommendations. A validation team gives feedback on the effectiveness of the program, along with suggestions for improvement. This feedback is addressed in each unit plan. Unit plans occur every year, and SLO reports occur twice yearly. Program review is completed for all programs, including CTE, Noncredit, and Contract Education. (II.A.16)

Conclusion: The College meets the standard.

Commendation 1: The team commends the College for ensuring continuous, equitable student access to instruction and support services regardless of location and mode of delivery through five traumatic events, exemplifying the College's "Students First" philosophy while ensuring fiscal stability during times of crises and uncertainty in funding. (II.A.7; II.C.3; III.D.9)

II.B. Library and Learning Support Services

General Observations:

Butte College provides support for student learning and achievement with sufficient services and materials for students, faculty, and staff through its Library and Center for Academic Success (CAS). Personnel with the appropriate expertise are in positions to select and maintain the educational equipment and materials that support student learning. Statistical and survey data guide the evaluation and assessment of library and learning support services and how they contribute to the attainment of student learning outcomes. These evaluations inform decisions that may improve services. The library documents contractual agreements with service providers such as database subscriptions and with Wi-fi providers. The college reviews all subscriptions and service agreements twice annually.

Findings and Evidence:

Butte College has libraries on its main campus and at its Chico Center. Computer labs and study rooms are available at both locations. The college's Center for Academic Success (CAS) provides service on these two campuses, at the Glenn County Center, to the Student Athlete Success Program (SASP), and also offers Supplemental Instruction for historically difficult courses to all students. Library services include specialized instruction upon appointment, reference service, a full-credit Research Strategies course (LIS 11), and a full range of online video resources. Smart classroom technology is available in both libraries and the college offers laptop and Wi-Fi hotspot checkout to students with automatic renewals and no overdue fines. The library also offers online test proctoring and in-person proctoring at the Chico Center. The library has a strong online presence to support Distance Learning, including 24/7 chat service and LibGuides. The current collection offers over 73,000 books, 61,557 e-books, 76 databases, and Interlibrary Loan services (II.B.1).

The Center for Academic Success (CAS) is the primary learning support service for students at the college. CAS supports both faculty and students through open communication, supplemental instruction, tutoring, Critical Skills Workshops, Learning Resource Specialists, credit courses,

and academic coaching. CAS selects and trains student tutors and supports a Reading/Writing Center with permanent Instructional Aides. All services are available online and the college offers additional support through NetTutor when CAS tutors are not available. The SASP offers an Athlete Academy orientation to help inform student athletes of services available (II.B.1).

Butte College relies upon a Collection Development Policy, weeding policy, library department liaisons, outreach, and faculty consultation to select and maintain appropriate equipment and materials to support student learning. A librarian participates on the Curriculum Committee to ensure support for all programs. The library uses several tools to review and evaluate resources. In addition to these tools, the college utilizes the statewide Library Services Platform. The collection development process examines usage statistics and cost in making determinations. The college draws expertise in collection development from collaboration with faculty from all disciplines (II.B.2).

The Center for Academic Success (CAS) works with thirteen committees across the district to determine services and materials needed to support students. The CAS Advisory Committee meets annually and selects materials and services through collaboration with faculty and learning support professionals across the college (II.B.2).

Butte college uses surveys, class evaluations, analysis of reports and plans, and statistical data to evaluate library and learning support services. An anonymous campus survey of students, faculty, and staff is utilized every two to three years. Survey data indicated a need for more laptops and Wi-fi access and the college's action on this item shows attention to student needs. Library and learning support services have identified SLOs and use the ACRL Framework for Information Literacy to inform the library's SLO report. This report also provides a plan for clarifying how the college reports and assesses these SLOs. Additionally, the college uses rubric-based self-evaluations to assess SLOs on specific projects. The Center for Academic Success (CAS) evaluates the SLOs for its courses and programs and retains the data in an Outcomes Repository. Faculty and staff review data to shape the future content and delivery of services offered (II.B.3).

Butte College collaborates through subscription services to provide library and learning support services. Some of these agreements are clearly documented and include participation in the California Community College Library Consortium to acquire research databases, the statewide Library Services Platform (LSP), OCLC, 24/7 Chat Service, and Digital Wish/Mobile Beacon for Wi-fi service (II.B.4).

Conclusion:

The College meets the standard.

II.C. Student Support Services

General Observations

Butte College provides, evaluates, and improves comprehensive student support services programs that enhance its ability to fulfill its mission. Butte's Student Services personnel are

committed to helping their students achieve their personal, academic, and career goals and have embraced the College's commitment to its equity agenda. and ensure equitable access to their programs in person at their Main Campus and centers as well as on-line. Student services personnel work together with their leaders to collect data about their students' needs and learning outcomes through surveys, student tracking software, national/peer-institution studies, and assessment instruments and use these data to measure the quality and effectiveness of their programs. All Student Services programs undergo Unit Planning every year and Comprehensive Program Reviews once every seven years which facilitate a review of program quality and improvement. Butte College's co-curricular programs enable its students to engage in a wide range of personal development interests including clubs, participatory governance, athletics, arts, and special student centers. Admissions procedures, student records, and testing instruments comply with board policies, administrative procedures, and State/Federal regulations.

Findings and Evidence:

Butte uses regularly scheduled unit planning and program review processes as their means to assess student services departments' learning outcomes and to evaluate program effectiveness. All Student Services programs and departments complete their Unit Plans annually and undertake a comprehensive program review once every seven years . The Student Services Leadership Team Committee (SSLTC) reviews these program reports for quality and mission alignment. Butte College has developed dashboards to assist in obtaining student data. One of these dashboards is the Unit Planning Dashboard which allows employees to drill down and disaggregate student success data (II.C.1)

The College identifies learning and assesses learning support outcomes appropriate to the students it serves and uses its Program Review and Unit Planning processes to determine strategies likely to continuously improve their services. The College's Student Equity Plan (2019-2022) informs how it can use student success data that are disaggregated by students' ethnicities, enrollment status, age, county of residence, and other social characteristics to continuously improve programs designed to appropriately support Butte's minoritized, disabled, veterans, economically/educationally disadvantaged, former foster youth, formerly incarcerated, LGBTQ, English language learners, and undocumented students. Butte uses regularly scheduled student assessments such as the Community College Survey of Student Engagement (CCSSE) and its institutional Completers/Leavers Surveys to gauge students' satisfaction with their experiences with traumatic crises, such as Camp (2018) and Bear (2020) Fires and COVID-19 (2020) to identify most critical needs. (II.C.2)

Butte College provides equitable, appropriate, comprehensive, and reliable access to all students at its various sites: Main Campus, Chico Center, Glenn County Center, Skyway Center, Cosmetology and Barbering facility, and via distance delivery by its website, phone, email engagement with students. Butte increases access to its support services by providing bus transportation to its Main Campus from its Chico, Oroville, and Paradise Centers. Butte provides students access to its on-line resources through its computer labs, laptop rentals, media and technical support, chatbots, and Microsoft Office software, free of charge. To ensure that students in crisis may receive priority services, Butte introduced Roadrunner Cares Priority Pass that can be initiated by any student, staff or faculty member. In response to the impact on its

students due to recent fires, the College opened a Support Center at the Chico Center and conducted an online survey of students to determine the extent of the fire's impact and to assess what services were needed. The Support Center was able to provide food and basic needs, disaster relief, financial aid assistance, counseling and advising, access to computer labs, and a call center. Additionally, the College Institutional Research Office coordinated with the California Department of Forestry and Fire Protection (CDF) to join the College database with the CDF database. The College matched the most recent addresses of its students with the areas that were confirmed burned so assistance could be provided, including connection to campus and community resources. Moreover, Butte implemented an integrated "student first" approach to identify additional resources to aid in their students' recovery and to better understand their particular needs. (II.C.3).

Butte offers comprehensive co-curricular and athletics through Student Life programming, Athletics, student organizations, Associated Students, Theater and Arts, and student centers dedicated to special student interests such as LGBTQ, Veterans, Undocumented Students, and Former Foster Youth, and Formerly Incarcerated Adults. Each program receives appropriate levels of supervision that are guided by commensurate levels of Board Policies and standards of integrity, including financial oversight. Student athletes are ensured support for their academic achievement by way of a dedicated counselor to monitor their progress and need for interventions. (II.C.4)

Butte prepares student services personnel to serve as academic advisors, beginning with an intensive training for new counselors whereby they are assigned with mentor counselors who ensure completion of the training regimen. Butte provides training and on-going professional development to those who provide academic advising functions by presenting information at staff meetings, Flex workshops, and initiatives sponsored by CCC Chancellor's Office, CSU, and UC Systems. The College orients students to its programs of study, support services, and degree requirements through mandatory orientations, First-Year Experience courses, and Guided Pathways Initiative. Butte also offers specialized orientations for student athletes, EOPS participants, Veterans, and Inspiring Scholars (former foster youth), and Ascending Scholars (formerly incarcerated adults.) The implementation of Guided Pathways provides a structured process to help new and continuing students enter a pathway to program completion, including the recommended sequence of courses for programs. Recently, Butte's Admissions and Records Office implemented a "preferred name" project to allow students to request a preferred name to be placed on a class roster and transcript. (II.C.5)

Butte adheres to Board-approved admission policies that are consistent with its mission. As an open access community college, all students who apply and can meet the legal qualifications for admission, are admitted. Butte has also adopted admissions policies for specialized programs such as international students and dual enrollment and makes these requirements clear to prospective students. Butte provides students with clear information on how to achieve their degree, certificate, and transfer goals, starting with its 5-step matriculation process and electronic welcome letter. (II.C.6)

The team confirmed that Butte regularly evaluates the effectiveness of its admissions and placement practices and instruments during meetings, retreats, and program reviews conducted

by its Admissions and Records and Career and Assessment personnel. Butte reduces biases of these tools for English language learners and those with limited computer access or literacy by providing a paper application. (II.C.7)

Butte follows Federal data reporting and privacy regulations and Board Policies and Administrative Procedures to maintain student records permanently, securely, and confidentially. Butte uses Ellucian as their student information system and document imaging system to ensure that its electronic records are regularly backed up and secured. New employees are trained in student record security, confidentiality, and Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA). Butte publishes its policies regarding release of student records on its Admissions and Records website and in its Catalog. (II.C.8)

Conclusion:

The College meets the Standard.

See Commendation 1.

Standard III

Resources

III.A. Human Resources

General Observations:

Butte College has established board policies, administrative procedures, and collective bargaining agreements that govern all aspects of human resources. Qualifications for employment are appropriate to the position and include relevant degrees and expertise. Equivalency of degrees and certificates earned outside the United States are enforced. The College has an extensive professional development program for its full-time and associate faculty, staff, managers, and administrators. The College has established processes for evaluating its employees but needs to ensure that evaluations are completed in a timely manner. Employee records are safely and securely handled.

Findings and Evidence:

Butte College has appropriate Board Policies and Administrative Procedures governing the hiring of all employees. The job descriptions are available online, including job qualifications, skills, and representative duties. The College's hiring process follows the college's Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Plan to ensure the recruitment of diverse applicants. The College has a process for revising class specifications regularly (III.A.1)

Butte College has an established hiring procedure for full-time and associate faculty. The job announcement includes the representative duties, expectations for professional growth and currency, departmental responsibilities, service to the college and the community, minimum educational and professional experience qualifications, diversity and equity qualifications, and desired qualifications. The College also includes a link to the college's mission and vision in the

job announcement. Furthermore, the job announcement consists of the faculty's role in course improvement, program development and evaluation, and unit plan and program review processes. The College uses a screening tool that reflects the qualifications listed in the job announcement. Job descriptions for Instructional Department Chairs include coordination of unit plans, program review, and student learning outcomes. Butte employs an Equal Employment Opportunity Plan to ensure an equitable and fair hiring process to identify diverse and qualified candidates. (III.A.2)

The administrators and staff responsible for educational programs and services possess the qualifications necessary to perform their duties as listed in their job descriptions and expectations of their employees. Degrees and desirable qualifications are aligned with the job duties of the positions. The College has an established hiring process for all administrators and staff. To maintain institutional effectiveness and academic quality, the College reviews administrators' existing job descriptions and makes changes, when necessary, before advertising the position. (III.A.3)

The College's hiring procedures require new employees to provide a copy of their official transcript of records before starting employment. The procedures include verification of the institution accredited by U.S. accrediting agencies. For foreign degrees, the College provided a list of agencies for evaluation and translation. (III.A.4)

Evaluation procedures for all employee groups are stated in the collective bargaining agreements – full-time faculty, associate faculty, classified staff, and police staff. Likewise, an established procedure is codified in the management, supervisory, and confidential handbook for unrepresented employees. The appropriate evaluation forms are on the human resources website for easy access. A process for performance improvement is part of the overall evaluation process for all employees.

The team carefully reviewed the evidence and identified that the College is not consistent in ensuring effectiveness of its employees by evaluating staff and managers at stated periodic intervals. A significant proportion of classified staff and manager evaluations are overdue and does not meet the evaluation cycles set forth in board policy for managers and the collective bargaining agreement for classified staff. (III.A.5)

The College has an established process for determining faculty needs. The human resources needs for The College are part of the Planning, Budgeting, and Assessment (PBA) process. The College uses the state's Faculty Obligation Number (FON) as a metric to determine the sufficient number of full-time faculty. Considerations for determining faculty need include the mission and strategic initiatives, the educational master plan, student access requirements, labor market requirements, budget capacity, enrollment management projections, grant deliverables, regulatory compliance, productivity ratios, full-time faculty leadership, program integrity, part-time faculty pools by discipline, and replacement of retiring faculty. The Planning and Budget Committee reviews the faculty prioritization and recommends hiring to the president. The annual catalog includes the educational background of its full-time faculty. (III.A.7)

The College's associate faculty accounted for 40.4% of its Full Time Equivalent Faculty (FTEF) in the fall 2020 semester. The College has a separate bargaining unit for associate faculty and has a collective bargaining unit covering orientation, oversight, evaluation, seniority, and

professional development opportunities. The College has an established process for integrating associate faculty into the institution. Associate faculty are invited to participate in department/college meetings, governance committees, and the Great Teaching Seminar, among other training and activities. The College has an annual Associate Faculty Conference designed to address the associate faculty's needs and help orient them to the college and its students appropriately. (III.A.8)

Butte College has an established process for reviewing job descriptions before open recruitment to ensure that stated minimum qualifications are appropriate and applicants will have the requisite knowledge, skills, and ability to effectively support the educational, technological, physical, and administrative operations of the College. The College also has a process for new positions using an established position description questionnaire (PDQ) to identify essential job functions and other classification attributes. Requests for new positions from departments are part of the annual unit planning process. The vice presidents annually review and update their organizational structure as part of human resources planning. (III.A.9)

Butte College uses established processes for determining the number of administrators to determine institutional capacity. The College uses the program review process to determine administrators for each division. The hiring of administrators includes criteria for appropriate preparation, education, and expertise necessary to support the mission and purpose. The job descriptions have duties, minimum and desired qualifications, knowledge, skills, abilities, and supervisory responsibilities. The College uses the minimum qualifications defined in California's education code to determine the educational attainment needed for each administrator position. The annual catalog includes the educational background of its administrators. (III.A.10)

The College has established board policies and administrative procedures for human resources. These board policies and administrative procedures are on the website. All collective bargaining agreements with bargaining units and the management, supervisory, and confidential handbook are also available on the college's website. (III.A.11)

Butte College adopted and established an Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Plan, completed in 2019. The College also hired an Inclusion, Diversity, Equity, and Anti-Racist Officer to provide leadership towards diversity, equity, inclusion, and anti-racism efforts. The College started collecting demographic information of applicants in 2018 to serve as data for achieving its EEO plans. The College has used the longitudinal data to determine gaps and develop appropriate actions to reduce gaps. An EEO Committee serves as an advisory body for all equity and diversity issues. The board policy and administrative procedure provide direction to the College on EEO. (III.A.12)

The College has an established written code of professional conduct for all its employees, including the members of the Board of Trustees. The institutional code of ethics is codified in board policy and administrative procedures and are publicized on the website. Some groups, such as the classified senate and the academic senate, have an additional code of ethics. (III.A.13)

Butte College has a Professional Development program for its employees. The College has a robust professional development program that includes 11 to 12 days of personal and professional development activities per academic year. An assessment of employees' training

needs precedes the development of the annual program to ensure currency and relevance. An individual FLEX plan is one of the ways the College evaluates its professional development offerings. Furthermore, the College has institutionalized an annual Classified Professionals Week and Classified Professionals Day since the 1980s. Professional development opportunities include equity and diversity training. The College established a Professional Development Committee for classified staff training needs. Travel funds are available for staff to request through this committee. The Butte College Leader Development Institute enhances the leadership proficiency of its employees. (III.A.14)

The Human Resources department at Butte College serves as the custodian of all personnel records. Appropriate processes are in place to secure the confidentiality of records. Employees have access to their personnel records per collective bargaining agreements. The College has an administrative procedure governing access to personnel records by employees. (III.A.15)

Conclusions:

The College meets the standard, with the exception of III.A.5.

Recommendation 1: In order to meet the Standard, the team recommends the College assure the effectiveness of all employees by evaluating them systematically and at stated intervals. (III.A.5)

III.B. Physical Resources

General Observations:

Butte College delivers its programs and services from its safe, sufficient, well-designed, and well-maintained facilities within its large and uniquely situated District. The College uses participatory governance and assessment driven processes to develop its Educational Master Plans (2015, 2016, and 2018). Collection and analysis of qualitative and quantitative data informed the development and implementation of the District's Facilities Master Plan (FMP) which drives the College's processes for integrated planning, utilization, maintenance, budgeting, and improvement of its physical resources.

Findings and Evidence:

Butte College maintains safe and sufficient facilities at its main campus and two centers (Chico Center and Glenn County Center) and is sufficient for the needs of the community it serves. The College provides a safe environment for its students and employees by regularly evaluating the condition, accessibility, and safety of the locations through multiple, regularly scheduled planning processes. The College has implemented procedures for reporting unsafe conditions and makes an annual budget allocation of \$10,000 to address immediate health and safety remediation. The College regularly contracts consulting and inspection services from compliance experts and a joint powers authority to manage and keep its Injury and Illness Prevention program current. Regularly scheduled inspections of facilities occur by internal stakeholders on the Safety Committee and external experts. These inspections conclude with a written report to correct deficiencies with a follow up to ensure recommendations are addressed. (III.B.1)

The College's Educational Master Plans (EMP) (2015, 2016 and 2018), combined with its mission and core values, helped guide the development and implementation of the Facilities Master Plan (FMP) adopted in 2016. The overarching goal of the FMP is to build a campus through 2030, featuring a commitment to sustainability as a key component. The use of its EMP and FMP ensures that physical resource needs for its programs and services are the basis of facilities improvement and construction. The College uses the FMP to achieve its mission through the accomplishment of its strategic goals. The team acknowledges the College's efforts to start reviewing the current FMP to ensure that new physical resource needs are included in the revised version of the FMP emanating from the 2018 EMP and encourages the College to complete the revision by their Spring 2023 goal. The College has implemented sustainability measures to reduce water use and waste, to implement a robust recycling program, and to continue to reach their goal of net-zero energy by 2030. By including its College Energy Statement with its Five-Year Construction Plan, the College has adopted building plans that exceed California Code of Regulations Title 24 standards. The unit planning process guides the replacement and maintenance of program and service equipment. (III.B.2)

Butte College uses its FMP and EMP to determine programmatic and planning needs for its physical resources. With its FMP aligned with its EMP, the College collects data and evaluates the effective use of its physical resources through established processes that enable it to achieve its mission and vision. It also uses its space inventories, facility assessments, regulatory inspections, unit plans, and annual budget augmentation process to evaluate use of its physical resources and identify its future needs. The College uses the Fusion software to keep an accurate inventory of its facilities including specific attributes for management, planning, and maintenance. Through its Facilities and Transportation department, the College evaluates the utilization of its vehicle and equipment and schedules on-going maintenance for this fleet. (III.B.3)

The College follows a FMP (2015 - 2030) that supports its long-range capital planning in support of its EMP and strategic planning goals. The College has a process that determines the total cost of ownership (TCO) for capital projects that includes initial planning, recurring costs, and recapitalization of costs. The College uses the unit planning process to address the long-term planning and maintenance of its existing facilities. The College has demonstrated efficient planning as part of the process to ensure that capital projects support its goals. (III.B.4)

Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.

III.C. Technology Resources

General Observations:

Butte College provides extensive professional support, infrastructure, and systems to enable the College to support its instructional, services, and operational needs. The College has integrated technology training as part of its professional development activities for faculty and staff. The College has hardware and software in place to support

instruction and student learning for both in-person and online/distance education. The partnership with the California Community Colleges Technology Center for additional professional development needs enabled the College to provide training including information security.

The College has established processes for integrated planning, budgeting, and analysis to ensure its information technology resources' integrity, quality, capacity, reliability, and security. Planning occurs at various levels and, through its Technology Master Plan, has a systemic approach to continuous quality improvement. The Technology Council, which is part of the College's participatory governance structure, provides significant input in determining the needs of the College.

The College has established policies and procedures in technology that have been widely disseminated to students, faculty, and staff.

Findings and Evidence:

Butte College has an established planning process to identify its technology needs. The 2014-2020 Technology Master Plan adopted in 2015 aligned with the Educational Master Plan and Facilities Master Plan to identify the needs of the College to support the programs and services it provides to students. The Technology Master Plan addressed the instructional and administrative technology needs to support teaching, learning, and operations, including foundational IT infrastructure to ensure capacity, reliability, security, and availability. The team acknowledges the College's effort to start the development of a new Technology Master Plan that is expected to be completed by July 2022. The College recently completed the needs analysis by engaging Deloitte Higher Education Practice to facilitate the needs analysis by assessing the current infrastructure and meeting with various constituency groups. The consultant provided a set of recommendations to enhance the technology infrastructure and improve the security of its technology resources. The team encourages the College to consider the results of the needs analysis as a vital part of the new technology master plan.

The College has a dedicated IT Services and Support department that provides support to the needs of the College and has an established service desk. A dedicated unit, Technology Mediated Instruction, supports the growing online/distance education instructional method using the Canvas learning management system. The College also implemented 24/7 online learning resources through its library collection of e-books and electronic periodicals using Ex Libris.

In 2019, the College completed the migration of its operational/enterprise databases to ensure the Colleague infrastructure's stability, supportability, and security. Part of the migration included using the self-service functions of Colleague to improve the user experience. The College works with the CCC Information Security Center for information security monitoring and management. (III.C.1)

The College has established processes to support and maintain its infrastructure to meet the needs of teaching and learning and its operations. Using the established annual unit process, The College developed a network infrastructure plan reviewed annually. The Technology Council is

part of the decision-making process, which serves as the primary mechanism for input and feedback from various groups. Furthermore, the College has a technology equipment plan to ensure the currency of technology tools (personal computers, network equipment, server equipment, communications equipment, and classroom technology). The College uses various funding sources to keep currency in technology. (III.C.2)

Disaster recovery is part of the College's technology plan. The College has an established process that includes resource allocation for technology using the Planning, Budgeting, and Assessment (PBA) process. The College has systematic processes to maintain the technology infrastructure in all locations. The College has demonstrated its effective delivery of technology resources to ensure continued teaching and learning and to continue to deliver services, especially during the natural disasters that hit the district service area. (III.C.3)

Butte College has an established service desk to support the general technology needs of students and employees. In terms of online instruction, it has a Technology Mediated Instruction (TMI) unit to support and provide training to faculty in all online or distance education areas. The College also partners with the CCC Technology Center to provide training to faculty and holds periodic technology training during FLEX days. Through post-training surveys, the College uses this to determine the effectiveness of the training and suggest changes or improvements based on feedback. Newly hired full-time faculty are also given technology training as part of the onboarding process. (III.C.4)

Butte College has an adopted board policy and administrative procedure on the use of technology. Board Policy 3720 and Administrative Procedure (AP) 3720 provide guidelines on the use of computers and networks, and AP 6365 guides the accessibility of information technology. These policies and procedures are widely published through the College's website, and the College sends notices to all students, faculty, and staff to encourage the secure use of technology. (III.C.5)

Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.

III.D. Financial Resources

General Observations:

Butte College's mission and goals serve as the foundation for financial planning. Additionally, the College's various master and strategic plans are used for short and long-term goal setting. The College utilizes its planning, budgeting, and assessment process and has a Planning and Budgeting Committee to provide an opportunity for participation by all constituent groups. College finances are effectively and strategically managed to support and sustain learning programs and services, and the College ensures sufficient reserves to sustain its operations in the event of disasters and unforeseen events. The College has more than adequate financial resources and cash reserves to meet its mission and goals.

The College's organizational structure incorporates a clear delineation of fiscal responsibilities and accountability. Appropriate policies, procedures, and internal controls are implemented to guide fiscal compliance, fiscal stability, and transparency. Furthermore, the College sustains effective internal controls and provides regular, detailed budget reports to the Board of Trustees and the College community for review and to foster transparency.

Findings and Evidence:

Butte College has established a financial planning and resource allocation process. The process integrates planning, budgeting, and assessment to support and sustain programs and services. The College continuously demonstrates its ability to operate with integrity and financial stability. The Planning, Budgeting, and Assessment (PBA) process shows how the planning and budgeting processes articulate the mission and goals. There is an established process for budget requests through the PBA (program review and unit planning process) that augments the annual budget based on unit reviews and availability of funds. The Planning and Budgeting Committee is the participatory governance group that ensures allocation of resources complies with state guidelines and regulations, aligns resources with the college mission and goals, and provides an opportunity for all constituent groups to understand and participate in fiscal planning, management, and oversight.

The College employs a five-year model with projected revenues and expenditures to ensure financial planning ties with target enrollments and other metrics included in the Student-Centered Funding Formula. The Team confirmed through a review of the website the schedule of the budget development process and its alignment with established board policies and administrative procedures (BP and AP 6200 Budget Preparation, 6250 Budget Management, 6300 Fiscal Management, 6307 Debt Issuance and Management, and 6320 Investments). (III.D.1, III.D.2)

A budget forum is part of the process to allow constituent groups to participate in the budget planning process. Together with the other avenues for participation, such as the Planning and Budget Committee and presentations to the Board of Trustees in open session, the College effectively communicates and informs the college community regarding its finances and budget. The committee's documents and meeting notes are available on the website. The College's institutional planning process centers on the PBA process to integrate unit planning processes guided by the College's EMP, FMP, TMP, strategic plan, and other goals. (III.D.3)

Butte College has an established process of institutional financial planning. The planning includes developing a five-year budget projection with anticipated ongoing expenditures and revenues to provide the College with a picture of the potential revenues and expenditures. The projections use the information provided by the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office and the California Department of Finance. The College also updates the Board of Trustees periodically through study sessions to keep the board informed. (III.D.4)

The College uses Ellucian Colleague as its enterprise resource planning system for its financial and accounting functions. The College uses the system to implement internal controls and disseminate accurate and timely information to staff. Department managers have access to their real-time budget for informed decision-making. The College undergoes an annual audit by an external auditor, as required by the federal and state regulations, board policies, and the

California Community Colleges Contracted District Audit Manual. Financial information is routinely disseminated to the college community, and the Board of Trustees receives a quarterly presentation. The College has consistently received unmodified opinions on its financial audit with no findings of noncompliance nor recommendations. (III.D.5)

The Team reviewed the budget and financial reports and verified the College's clean audit opinions for the past several years, since 2013. The external auditor's opinion provides a high degree of credibility and reliability on the College's financial practices. The audit and budget information are disseminated and made available to the College and the community through various means. The Board of Trustees receives and accepts the audit reports annually, and the documents are posted on the website. The College has demonstrated appropriate allocation and use of financial resources to support student learning programs and services by complying with the State's 50% Law, where at least 50% of qualified expenditures are spent toward instructional activities. Over the past five years, the College has had the highest percentage compared to all other community college districts in the state. (III.D.6, III.D.7)

The College has a consistent practice of developing and using a multi-year budget projection to guide its financial planning. This process is part of the budget development process and is updated yearly to ensure that relevant and available information serves as the basis for an accurate projection. Regarding the institution's fiscal planning effectiveness, the Vice President of Administration and the Director Business Services frequently meet to discuss current financial issues and operations. (III.D.8)

The College has sufficient cash flow and completes regular cash flow and fund balance analysis to ensure fiscal stability. The Board of Trustees adopted an institutional effectiveness goal requiring the College to maintain reserves minimally at 25%. As such, the Team confirmed that the College's level of unrestricted general fund reserves is above the state recommended level of 5% and is available to help meet unforeseen financial emergencies. Over the last three years, the College has had 35.3%, 33.6%, and 35.4% fund reserves. The fund reserves are sufficient to cover financial emergencies, including state funding deferrals. (III.D.9)

The College practices effective oversight of all funds, including financial aid, grants, externally funded programs, and contractual relationships. Board Policies (i.e., BP 6300 Fiscal Management and AP6400 Audit) provide responsible stewardship over available resources. Additionally, a dedicated team of grant accountants serves departments/divisions to ensure compliance with all relevant regulatory requirements. The Team confirmed that auxiliaries, foundation, grant funding, and the Financial Aid Department had undergone external audits and are compliant with Title IV rules and regulations. (III.D.10)

As demonstrated through its annual audit reports and various budget documents, the College has the necessary resources needed to meet both short-term and long-term financial obligations. The College considers both current and future liabilities during its financial planning. The College has an irrevocable trust to manage its Other Post Employee Benefits (OPEB) obligations. The College uses CalPERS to manage these funds. The College has fully funded its OPEB liability with a net asset of \$4.58 million, as of 2020. The College approved a general obligation bond (Measure J) in 2016 for capital improvement projects amounting to \$190 million. Active and planned projects are reviewed and accepted periodically by the Citizens Bond Oversight Committee. An independent auditor also audits the activities and internal controls over Measure

J funds. The College has consistently received unmodified/unqualified opinions for relevant performance audits. (III.D.11, III.D.12, III.D.13, III.D.14)

The annual independent audits confirm that the College complies with all federal requirements in the packaging and disbursement of federal financial aid. Additionally, the College's student loan default rate of 8.0%, 17.9%, and 20.8% for the three-year cohort (2017, 2016, and 2015) follows federal regulations of less than a 30% default rate over three years. (III.D.15)

The College relies on professional service and maintenance contracts to meet its institutional goals. Interviews confirmed that the college routinely assesses contracts to ensure that the needs of the College community are met. The Team verified that the contract language contained an appropriate reference to terms, conditions, risk mitigation, termination clauses, and appropriate signature from a College designated signer to protect the institution effectively. The College's contractual agreements follow established Board of Trustees Policies and Administrative Procedures (i.e., BP 6340, AP 6330, BP 6340 Bids and Contracts, AP 6330). Additionally, the College has a purchasing manual that assists in procuring using various funding sources. The College also adheres to the general procurement standards. (III.D.16)

Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.
See Commendation 1.

Standard IV Leadership and Governance

IV.A. Decision-Making Roles and Processes

General Observations:

Leaders across Butte College create and encourage innovation to promote student success and sustain academic quality, integrity, fiscal stability, and continuous improvement through clear and appropriately defined governance roles, responsibilities, structure, processes, and practices as defined and delineated in Board Policies and Administrative Procedures.

Findings and Evidence:

Butte College's institutional leaders create and encourage innovation through regular creation of task forces or teams who are then afforded "significant latitude to create the final product or recommendations," which is exemplified by the College's COVID 19 response as well as its Professional Development Program among other examples. These task forces and teams further indicate the College's "reliance on leadership of task force/teams based on qualifications and expertise in the subject," charging those responsible for on the ground management/direction with a strong voice in planning. Of particular note, the College's development of its Educational Master Plan demonstrates the well-connected use of systematic participative processes to assure effective creation and implementation of plans with significant institution-wide implications. (IV.A.1)

The College maintains appropriate policies and procedures that define roles and responsibilities for administrators, faculty, staff, and students in decision-making processes as evidenced in BP 2510 — Participation in Local Decision Making and BP 2515 — Relationship with Academic Senate and further operationalized through Butte College’s Institutional Effectiveness Manual, a central document that maps intended institutional outcomes to governance groups and committees, defines various types of groups at the College, provides clear flowcharts to show relationships between “decision-making bodies and the campus community,” and identifies the purpose of and relationships between key groups. The Institutional Effectiveness Manual states whether student representatives are required, recommended, and/or requested for all committees at the College, which indicates well-integrated student voice in decision-making. (IV.A.2)

The College's administrators and faculty have a substantive and clearly defined role in institutional governance. BP 2510 and BP 2515 clearly define administrator and faculty roles in institutional governance; BP 2515 articulates the reliance on mutual agreement or advice and judgment of Academic Senate for policies/procedures relative to academic and professional concerns. Both faculty and administrator contributions and roles are outlined in the unit planning process and supporting policies related to applicable areas of responsibility and expertise. (IV.A.3)

The College clearly defines appropriate structures, policies, and procedures for faculty and administrators' responsibilities regarding recommendations concerning curriculum and student learning programs and services, the primary avenues being the Curriculum Committee, SLO Committee, and Academic Senate. In addition, the College supports informed planning through cross-representation as evidenced by the College including a Distance Education Committee representative on the Curriculum Committee. (IV.A.4)

The College ensures timely action on institutional plans and policies through its governance system and through appropriate consideration of relevant and broad perspectives, which is demonstrated in the work of the College’s responses to the Camp Fire and the COVID-19 pandemic. Board resolutions charged the Superintendent/President with broad authority to take appropriate crisis response action. The College’s Safe Reopening Task Force included key stakeholders given authority over their respective areas, which allowed for thorough and thoughtful considerations of needs and challenges across the College. (IV.A.5)

The College communicates processes for decision-making and the resulting decisions broadly across the institution via updates to participatory governance groups, district email announcements, regular communications like Roadrunner Tracks, as well as web pages that include a library of past communications. (IV.A.6)

The College evaluates its governance structure and decision-making processes through two avenues. College Council "serves as a centralized mechanism to evaluate the role of leadership, governance, and decision-making structures and to ensure their integrity and effectiveness." In addition, the Board of Trustees assesses governance structure through its annual self-evaluation and goal-setting process. Both the Board of Trustees and College Council communicate updates to structures and processes via their website and regular meetings. The team acknowledges the evolving role of College Council and encourages the College to further define and clarify College Council's role in the governance structure and decision-making processes. (IV.A.7)

Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.

IV.B. Chief Executive Officer

General Observations:

Butte College's Superintendent/President is charged with the primary responsibility for the quality of the institution. Through clear and appropriate institutional structures and processes and regular communication, the College demonstrates the Superintendent/President's appropriate delegation of oversight within its administrative structure, commitment to continuous institutional improvement of the teaching and learning environment, regular cross-college involvement in ensuring compliance with accreditation standards, and implementation of statutes and regulations.

Findings and Evidence:

The College, through Board Policy, charges the Superintendent/President with primary responsibility for the quality of the institution as noted in BP 2430 — Delegation of Authority to the Superintendent/President. In addition, the College's AP 2435 — Evaluation of the Superintendent/President evidences an existing process for evaluating the CEO's efficacy in leadership. This process includes opportunities for feedback from students, staff, faculty, administrators, and community members. (IV.B.1)

The College's Superintendent/President, as guided by BP 3100 — Organizational Structure, establishes and maintains an organizational structure "to best accomplish the mission and goals of the District." The College's institutional structures and processes are clear and demonstrate appropriate delegation of oversight to members of the President's Leadership Team, which is illustrated via well-mapped organizational charts. In addition, the College structures and processes that support the CEO's execution of responsibilities are further elucidated in the College's Institutional Effectiveness Manual. In reviewing and making potential changes to a recent executive-level position, the Superintendent/President sought college input including the Vice President of Student Services' perspective related to their areas of responsibility. The Superintendent/President acknowledges the role of faculty, via the Academic Senate, as having

authority on academic matters and delegates appropriate responsibility to the Vice President of Instruction to collaborate and liaise with as well as provide direction to faculty. (IV.B.2)

The College demonstrates, through policies and procedures, a commitment to continuous improvement to teaching and learning via collegial processes and evaluation and planning informed by high quality research. The College's Multi-Year Integrated Planning System and Planning, Budgeting, and Assessment Process demonstrate a regular, systematic process and clear set of guidelines that inform unit planning, budgeting, and resource allocation. The College established, monitors, and communicates institutional performance standards via the California Community College Chancellor's Office Balance Scorecard, and utilizes qualitative data from periodic surveys such as SENSE and CCSSE to inform evaluation and planning. (IV.B.3)

The College, through established Board Policy, tasks the Superintendent/President with ensuring the District meets all accreditation standards. The College demonstrates a clear structure to support cross-college "planning, actions, progress updates, and regular feedback" through appointment of the Accreditation Liaison Officer and a "multi-faceted accreditation team structure." The Superintendent/President leads Board study sessions and communicates updates and progress to the College via the District's webpage as well as presentations. (IV.B.4)

The Superintendent/President, as guided by established board policies and administrative procedures, assures the implementation of statutes and regulations, which is evidenced by the College's response to recent unexpected crises. The College's COVID 19 response demonstrates timely and appropriate action, delegation of authority, and communication across the College and with the local community. (IV.B.5)

The College's Superintendent/President demonstrates regular communication to the communities served by the institution through multiple channels including participation in college events and ceremonies; regular newsletters; emails to the college community; membership in local organizations; and regular meetings with key college stakeholders, educational leaders, and community partners. (IV.B.6)

Conclusions: The College meets the Standard.

IV.C Governing Board

General Observations:

The Butte-Glenn Community College District Board of Trustees comprises seven publicly elected members representing different geographical areas within the District, and a student trustee, who holds an advisory vote. The College has established Board Bylaws, Board Policies, and Administrative Procedures that govern all aspects of Board and College operations.

Findings and Evidence:

The College demonstrates that, as outlined in a number of Board Policies, its Board has authority over and responsibility for policies to assure the academic quality, integrity, and effectiveness of student learning programs and services and the financial stability of the institution. (IV.C.1)

The College's Board Policy 2330 — Quorum and Voting stipulates guidelines for voting to ensure action as a collective entity. All Board members act in support of decisions once decisions are made as evidenced in a recent decision regarding whether to establish a vaccine mandate. (IV.C.2)

The College has established policies for the selection and evaluation of the Superintendent/President by the Board. The College's BP 2431 — Superintendent/President (CEO) Selection defines the Board's role and process guidelines for the selection of the Superintendent/President, and BP 2435 and AP 2435 detail the Board's process for evaluation of the Superintendent/President. The Board adheres to applicable policies and procedures in the evaluation of the Superintendent/President. (IV.C.3)

The Board states its commitment to reflecting the public interest, which is supported by the College's development, enhancement, and expansion of a number of vocational training programs in response to community's needs despite state emphasis on transfer degrees and the Board's establishment of a vaccine mandate. (IV.C.4)

The College's Board of Trustees, as evidenced in BP 2200 — Board Duties and Responsibilities has clearly defined responsibilities for governance. The Board is charged with approving "virtually every major decision" at the College and engages with the community in its regular monthly meetings on matters regarding "current operations and planning for the future of the District." The College's mission informs the Board's goal and policy development processes. (IV.C.5)

The College publishes all of the Board of Trustees' bylaws and policies, which can be found on the Butte College Board of Trustees webpage. The policies appropriately specify the Board's size, duties, responsibilities, structure, and operating procedures. (IV.C.6)

The College's Board Policy 2410 — Policy and Administrative Procedure defines the Board's role in policymaking. A Board policy advisory subcommittee develops and reviews policies and recommends changes to the Board. Though Board Policies are reviewed regularly, the team has observed a number of outdated policies. In addition, the team noted the need for more cyclical, regular review, and update of Administrative Procedures to ensure currency and effective implementation of District policies. (IV.C.7)

The College demonstrates institutional review of key student learning and achievement indicators as well as review and assessment of institutional plans through updates and reports at regular Board meetings as well as twice-yearly Board retreats, where trustees review key indicators, which inform the development of improvement plans. (IV.C.8)

The Board of Trustees has established policy that outlines the Board's responsibility to commit to its ongoing development and to a trustee education program that includes new trustee orientation. All new trustees undergo orientation and are provided with key information such as the Trustee Handbook. In addition, trustees participated in the California Community College Fellowship and participated in DEI training. Continuity of Board membership is ensured through staggered terms of office. (IV.C.9)

The College maintains clear policies regarding Board evaluation. The College's BP 2745 — Board Self-Evaluation and AP 2745 — Board Self-Evaluation provide guidance regarding the Board's annual self-evaluation. The Board discusses results of its self-evaluation at its June retreat and communicates the findings to the public. In addition, the Board reviews its annual goals based upon results of the self-evaluation. (IV.C.10)

BP 2715 — Board Code of Ethics, AP 2715 — Board Code of Ethics, BP 2710 — Conflict of Interest, and AP 2710 — Conflict of Interest provide clear guidance regarding code of ethics and conflict of interest. The code of ethics policies are reviewed annually, and Trustees submit Form 700: Statement of Economic Interests to the Superintendent/President each year. (IV.C.11)

The Board delegates full responsibility and authority to the CEO to implement and administer board policies without Board interference as outlined in BP 2430 — Delegation of Authority to Superintendent/President. The Board engages in regular evaluation of the Superintendent/President and review of their goals and progress towards established goals. (IV.C.12)

The Board receives information from key College representatives regarding accreditation eligibility requirements, standards, and processes as well as ACCJC policies. In addition, the Board reviews and approves the College's ISER and participates in the self-evaluation process (IV.C.13)

Conclusion:

The College meets the Standard.

Recommendation 2: In order to strengthen the currency, integrity, and effectiveness of policies, the team recommends the College and Board review its process to ensure timely review and implementation of all Board Policies and Administrative Procedures. (IV.C.7)

Quality Focus Essay

According to the ACCJC guidelines, projects described in the Quality Focus Essay (QFE) should be realistic and workable and should culminate in a set of observable and measurable outcomes. The QFE's factual basis and data analysis should be consistent with the other portions of Butte College's ISER, notably the student achievement data presented. The QFE will provide Butte College with a multi-year, long term direction for improvement of student learning outcomes and student achievement and will demonstrate Butte College's commitment to excellence.

The peer review team reviewed the QFE essay provided by Butte College that identified "adaptable Course Design" and "Online Student Education Planning" as college-wide goals with both short- and long-term activities that will be implemented over the next five years. The goal is stated as "Since 2017, Butte College and the communities it serves have experienced five traumatic events, all of which have had a significant impact on delivery of instruction and counseling services. The 2017 Oroville Dam Spillway Incident resulted in the evacuation of nearly 200,000 people. The deadly Camp Fire in November 2018 destroyed the entire town of Paradise and devastated surrounding communities. Ongoing, grid-based electrical shutdowns then followed, impacting the campus and most of its service areas. In March 2020, the COVID-19 pandemic shut down schools and businesses, and in September of that same year, the North Complex fire ravaged many of the communities the College serves.

Throughout the spectrum of crisis, Butte College has maintained its mission as a student centered learning institution, and has worked to continuously evaluate and improve instruction and student services, no matter the circumstances. The two projects in this Quality Focus Essay (QFE) were initially developed in response to these crises. The College is utilizing the opportunity of the QFE to further develop and operationalize them at scale for the purposes of improving student learning and achievement, specifically in the areas of persistence and completion.

Project 1: Adaptable Course Design

The first QFE project submitted by Butte is an instructional response to the need to serve students in times of crisis. It incorporates Adaptable Course Design (ACD), which is a strategy for building courses that are intentionally flexible during large-scale emergencies and which facilitate support for individual students (during individual emergencies, in response to their learning goals, and to meet other needs). ACD is a synthesis of numerous course design and teaching frameworks including Authentic Assessment, Universal Design for Learning, Culturally Responsive Teaching, Transparency in Learning and Teaching, Backward Design, and Online Course Design. These frameworks can be used to design courses with built-in adaptability to student needs.

The QFE describes the steps that will be taken to implement the ACD platform, as well as provide professional development for all stakeholders throughout the pilot and implementation stage.

Anticipated Measurable Outcomes Project 1 outcome measures include:

1. Faculty Training Outcomes: Number of faculty attending ACD workshops, completing the playlist, and completing the certificate; evaluations of toolbox components; faculty course design surveys.

2. Student Success Outcomes: Comparison of student success, persistence, retention and completion for faculty who have implemented ACD strategies and those who have not. The College also plans to compare the years before (2020-21) and after (2023-24) the project

Project 2: Online Student Education Planning

The second QFE project submitted by Butte is designed to improve greater access for students to online educational planning and to activate student educational planning within the College's existing Learning Management System (LMS) through Degree Audit.

Anticipated Measurable Outcomes Project 2 outcome measures include:

1. The number of students completing education plans will increase.
2. Student satisfaction with the academic advising process will increase.
3. Student access to counseling and advising services will increase.

Upon review of both of the QFE projects, the team finds that there are both qualitative and quantitative outcomes that can be achieved in the short- and long-term objectives planned. These include:

- Wide participation of campus stakeholder groups.
- Web presence and comprehensive communication strategies.
- Usage of trends and survey data to provide synthesis.
- Integration with current processes and college practice.

The team encourages assessing the Adaptable Course Design Toolkit and Certificate throughout the implementation process to make adjustments as needed. Pre and post metrics would aid in the long term sustainability of the both projects.